CITY OF COLUMBIA DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION MARCH 13, 2014- 4:00 PM

Minutes City Hall Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: LaToya Grate, Ashby Gressette, Doris Hildebrand, Bowen Horger, Dale Marshall,

John Powell, Robert Wynn

Member Absent: Harris Cohn, Beronica Whisnant

Staff: Amy Moore and John Fellows

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Dale Marshall at 4:00 PM, Roll Call – Quorum established, swearing in of applicants and public speakers, points of order.

Amy Moore, Preservation Planner, noted changes to the Agenda since publication. She proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. CONSENT AGENDA URBAN

HISTORIC

III. REGULAR AGENDA

URBAN

- 1. **500 Huger Street & S/S Blossom Street** (TMS#08914-16-02 and 08914-16-01) Request for site plan approval for private student dormitory. *Innovista Design District*
- 2. **500 Huger Street & S/S Blossom Street** (TMS# 08914-16-02 and 08914-16-01) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for private student dormitory. *Innovista Design District*

Mr. Fellows stated the site plan and design for **500 Huger Street & S/S Blossom Street** would be presented together, however a separate motion would be needed for 1) site plan approval and 2) request for Certificate of Design Approval.

This application previously presented in August 2013, consisting of a three-story and a five-story building. A special exception was granted this week by the Board of Zoning Appeals to exceed the density limit.

Ben Arnold, site owner, presented.

Roger Kyzer of Kitchen and Associates Architects, architect for the project, spoke on the design of the building.

Ted Blackwell, civil engineer, spoke on engineering issues.

Bob Guild, President of the Granby Neighborhood Association, voiced concerns with vehicular/pedestrian/bicycle traffic, connectivity issues and need for signalization. Mr. Guild said he is supportive of urban environment; however the Commission should take issues into consideration.

Ryan Nevius, Executive Director of Sustainable Midlands, echoed Mr. Guild's comments.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to accept the plans and recommend site plan approval for 500 Huger Street & S/S Blossom Street subject to the conditions set forth by City staff and their review comments with particular emphasis on the signaling and the pedestrian safety aspects.

Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand.

Mr. Gressette stated for clarification that the motion will include all City staff recommendations to be reviewed.

Motion for site plan approval granted 7-0.

Motion by Mr. Powell to approve the request for Certificate of Design Approval for 500 Huger Street & S/S Blossom Street subject to the conditions stated in the Agenda with deference to prior approvals of this particular project and with particular emphasis upon the window material, as vinyl has not been an approved as a material for windows in this district. All windows and details deferred to staff, including material selection. Other details that may come up during a design process also be deferred to staff, with attention to the unresolved design decisions on the SW corner of the facade.

Motion seconded by Ms. Grate. Motion for Certificate of Design Approval granted 7-0.

- 1. 550 Assembly Street Previously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting Request for site plan approval for office building. City Center Design Development District
- 2. 550 Assembly Street, 507-19 Main Street (TMS# R11303-11-01 and R11303-11-05)
 Request for Certificate Previously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting Center Design
 Development District
- 3. 611 Park Street 701 Previously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting 01 and 08914-18-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for site plan approval.
- 4. 611 Park Street 701 Park Street & F/S Lincoln Street (TMS#08915-09-01, 08915-10-01 and 08914-18-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for private student dormitory. Innovista Design District
- 5. 1213 Lady Street (TPreviously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting Design Approval for exterior changes and site improvements. *Pending Individual Landmark/City Center*

HISTORIC

1. 907 Senate Street (TMS# 08916-02-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and site improvements. *W. Gervais Street Historic Commercial District*

Connie Spencer, architect for the project, presented.

Motion by Ms. Grate to issue a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and site improvements for 907 Senate Street with the seven items noted in the Agenda deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Wynn. Request for Certificate of Design approval granted 7-0.

2. 1731 Heyward Street (TMS#11306-07-22) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and Preliminary Certification for the Bailey Bill. *Wales Garden Architectural Conservation District*

Staff finds that the proposal meets Section VII – Guidelines for Maintenance & Rehabilitation, Section VIII – Guidelines for Additions, and Section IX – Accessory Buildings, and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval for this project with the following conditions:

- The two windows on the right side of the addition shall be 6/1 wood or aluminum-clad windows with 5/8" muntins/grids and shall be consistent with existing window sizes on the side wing.
- All details deferred to staff

Staff also recommends that 1731 Heyward Street be given preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill.

David Brooks, property owner, presented.

No one spoke in favor or opposition of the request.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to approve the request for Certificate of Design Approval for exposed exterior changes for 1731 Heyward Street as proposed and to include staff recommendations such as the windows.

Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Request for Certificate of Design Approval granted 7-0,

Motion by Mr. Wynn to recommend preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill for 1731 Heyward Street conditional upon qualified rehabilitation expenses meeting or exceeding the 20% investment requirements.

Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill granted 7-0.

3. 201 Wateree Avenue (TMS#11306-04-29) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Wales Garden Architectural Conservation District*

Staff finds that due to the distance from the public right-of-way and the existing density of landscaping that will minimize the visibility of the addition, the proposal meets Section VIII – Guidelines for Additions and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval for this project with the following conditions:

- roofing material shall be clarified with staff
- the eaves of the addition shall be boxed
- two full-size windows or one pair of French doors shall be installed on the 32' blank wall
- and all details deferred to staff

Reid Wallace, M.R. Wallace Construction, contractor for the project, presented.

No one spoke in favor or opposition of the request.

Motion by Ms. Grate to issue a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes for 201 Wateree Avenue with the four conditions noted by staff in the agenda; specifically there be two full windows to match the configuration of existing windows and reflect appropriate materials according to the guidelines.

Motion seconded by Mr. Gressette.

Motion modified by Ms. Grate to add roofing materials to be deferred to staff. Request for Certificate of Design Approval granted 7-0.

4. 1301 Richland Street (TMS#09015-04-13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for site improvements. *Individual Landmark*

Staff cannot recommend for the proposal as it stands, according to Section 17-674 of the City ordinance, but could recommend for one of the options listed above in the evaluation, with details being worked out with staff. Landscape buffers will need to be fairly close in height to the 5' at the time of fence installation if this solution is approved. Staff also will need to see the specifications of a proposed fence prior to its being installed.

Rich Roberson and Pastor Brooks of Ebenezer Lutheran Church, owners, presented.

Elizabeth Marks, President of the Robert Mills Historic Neighborhood Foundation, spoke in favor of the request.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to grant the Request for Certificate of Design Approval for 1301 Richland Street for site plan improvements subject to review by the staff for those sensitive review items, such as the brick piers.

Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Request for Certificate of Design Approval granted 7-0.

5. 324 S. Edisto Avenue (TMS#11309-08-17) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Hollywood-Rose Hill Community Character Area*

Staff finds that according to the criteria listed in Section 17-674(e) of the City Code of Ordinances that the property contributes to ambience of the Hollywood-Rose Hill Community Character Area, has the ability to provide a reasonable economic return, is in relatively sound condition as evidenced by its continued habitation, is not under orders from the City to be demolished, and that the proposed project would negatively affect the character of this area; therefore Staff recommends denial of the request.

Holley Wallace, property owner, presented on his request. Mr. Wallace stated the property is not bringing in any money, and he cannot make a return on the investment of the property as it currently is.

Jim Kirkland, property owner of Cock and Bull, spoke on the proposal.

David Reddy, President of the Hollywood-Rose Hill Neighborhood Association, spoke in opposition to the request for demolition.

Charles Lesser, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

John Mark Dean, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Guy Jones, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Ryan Nevius, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Beth Bilderback, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Susan Carson Lambert, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Mary Bull, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Deborah Stirling, resident spoke in opposition of the request.

Suzanne Adlof, resident, spoke in opposition of the request.

Mr. Kirkland stated his support of the project.

Mr. Wallace spoke in rebuttal and in support of the project.

Motion by Mr. Gressette for the D/DRC to deny the Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition for 324 S. Edisto Avenue based on the recommendation of staff and Section 17-674(e) of the City Code of Ordinances.

Motion seconded by Mr. Powell. Motion to deny the Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition granted 7-0.

6. 1530 Harden Street (TMS11407-09-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for Exterior Changes. *Individual Landmark*

Jerome Simons, architect for the project, spoke on the request.

William Robinson, new Title III Director at Allen University, spoke on the building.

Commission members complimented the applicant. They commented that the changes were unobtrusive and were a good solution.

Motion by Mr. Powell to approve the Request for Certificate of Design Approval for 1530 Harden Street for exterior changes based on documents submitted, deferring all details to staff.

Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Request for Certificate of Design Approval granted 7-0.

7. 914 Gregg Street (TMS#11405-13-15) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *University Hill Architectural Conservation District*

Staff finds that the proposal does not meet Section 5 – Roof Pitch/Material and does not recommend granting a Certificate of Design Approval.

Staff would be happy to work with the applicant to develop a solution that is more in keeping with the historic character of the district.

Tim Hance, architect for the project, presented on the request for asphalt shingles on the main roof and a metal roof on the front porch.

Mr. Wynn considered the materials and major roof portion of the house and stated that a change to metal for that lower section would not be in keeping with the materials considered in Section 5, and should be denied on that behalf.

Mr. Gressette agreed with Mr. Wynn stating it should stay true to the district as a contributing house.

Motion by Mr. Wynn for the D/DRC to deny the Request for Certificate of Design Approval for 914 Gregg Street for exterior changes based on Section 5 of the guidelines concerning roof pitch and materials, and the consideration to maintain the character of the overall home and roof and keeping with guidelines and the district; and deferred to staff for further considerations, and all details deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Gressette.

Mr. Powell restated the motion for clarification: the motion is to deny the application that the lower portion of the roof alone be allowed to be standing seam metal as presented; however, deferring to staff items of that roof in terms of the shingle or modifications that may be necessary. Also deferring to staff the opportunity of changing the entire facility to a standing seam metal roof with details deferred to staff.

Motion to deny the Request for Certificate of Design Approval granted with Mr. Marshall in opposition.

- **8. 1224** Sumter (TMSPreviously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting 11401-03-01) Request for recommendation to landmark building. *Pending Individual Landmark*
- **9. 4035** Ensor Avent Previously Approved 2:2014 Special Meeting of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Seminary Ridge Architectural Conservation District*
- 10. 804 Gervais Street Previously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting y certification for the Bailey Bill. W. Gervais Street Historic Commercial District
- 11. 522 Lady Street (Previously Approved 2, 2014 Special Meeting) esign Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. W. Gervais Street Historic Commercial District
- 12. 2225 Park Street (Previously Approved 2-2014 Special Meeting Design Approval for site improvements. Elmwood Park Architectural Conservation District
- 13. 3220 Murray Street (TWS#13A)1-04-04 2P2014 special Meeting of Design Approval for addition. *Metrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

• Granby Grant update

Mr. Threatt provided a status update.

- West Gervais Plan Update
- Land Use Plan Update and Development Code Rewrite
- Bike Pedestrian Plan and Bike Feasibility Analysis Update

Mr. Fellows provided updates on all of the plans and projects.

• 1227 Heidt Street update

Ms. Moore provided updates on this house which had come for review before the DDRC and that had burned down recently.

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Mr. Gressette to approve the February minutes; seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Motion approved 7-0.

VI. ADJOURN

There being no further business, Motion to adjourn by Mr. Wynn. Meeting adjourned at 6:42 PM

Chairperson Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department